To: Members of the Pennsylvania Senate  
From: Undersigned Organizations and Individuals  
Date: June 28, 2022  
Re: Opposition to SB 1277 and SB 1278 – Don’t Say Gay Bills

We, the undersigned organizations and individuals in Pennsylvania that educate, promote, and defend the civil and human rights of all persons, write to urge your opposition to SB 1277 and SB 1278. These bills would create a hostile environment for LGBTQ youth, drive teachers from the field under the threat of lawsuits, and create a wedge between students and the people they learn from and rely on – counselors, nurses, and teachers. In the guise of parental rights, the bills would elevate the preferences of a single parent or a small group of parents over other parents and over an entire school community. Most importantly, these bills will undermine the ability of students to learn and thrive.

Schools must be welcoming and safe places for all students, especially those who have unique needs or are marginalized. Policymakers have made students’ mental health and bullying prevention top priorities and have advocated for funding and programs to support student well-being and prevent student self-harm. Policymakers have also acknowledged and taken steps to address both the short-term and long-term shortage of qualified teachers, counselors, and other school staff.

**SB 1278**

SB 1278 is similar to, and more restrictive than, Florida’s Don’t Say Gay law. The bill falsely equates discussions of sexual orientation and gender identity with sex education and would effectively forbid any acknowledgement of gay or transgender students or LGBTQ families until the sixth grade. It contends that sexual orientation and gender identity are only ideas, ignoring that gay and transgender students are real people, and in doing so the bill erases and dehumanizes children and their parents.

The bill would severely limit students’ First Amendment rights as well as their right to be free from discrimination based on sex. The U.S. Supreme Court and many federal courts, including in Pennsylvania, have consistently recognized and affirmed that discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation, transgender status, gender identity, or gender expression is unlawful discrimination “on the basis of sex” and is prohibited by law.¹ This protection encompasses the right of students to be addressed by the

---

¹ See e.g. *Bostock v. Clayton County*, 590 U.S. ____ 140 S.Ct. 1731 (2020)(dismissal of an employee for being gay or transgender is sex-based discrimination under Title VII); *Adams by and through Kasper v. School Board of St. Johns County*, No. 18-13592, 2021 WL 2944396 (11th Cir. Jul. 14, 2021)(bathroom policy which prevented transgender male student from using boys bathroom violated Equal Protection Clause); *Doe v. Boyertown Area Sch. Dist.*, 897 F.3d 518 (3d Cir. 2018)(allowing trans students to use facilities does not violate cisgender students’ right to privacy); *Evancho v. Pine Richland Sch. Dist.*, 237 F.Supp.3d 267 (WD Pa 2017)(school board resolution limiting trans students’ access to bathrooms held likely to succeed on Equal Protection claim); *A.H. by Handling v. Minersville Area Sch. Dist.*, 290 F.Supp.321 (MD Pa 2017)(trans student prohibited from using girls bathroom stated claim under Title IX and Equal Protection).
name and pronouns they use, even if they haven’t legally changed their name or gender. Purposefully and persistently misgendering a student has been found to constitute harassment or discrimination and may harm the mental and emotional health of students. The same analysis protecting students from discrimination in restroom use also applies to students’ rights to have their gender affirmed in how they are addressed at school. Explaining these principles of fair treatment and equity to students would be prohibited under SB 1278.

By contrast, affirming school environments are associated with reduced suicide risk among LGBTQ youth. LGBTQ youth who reported having at least one LGBTQ-affirming space had 35% reduced odds of reporting a suicide attempt in the past year. Conversely, a hostile school climate perpetuates higher rates of truancy, absenteeism, and dropping out for LGBTQ youth.

Student speech promoting fair and equitable treatment of LGBTQ people is also constitutionally protected speech. School officials may not prohibit students from engaging in speech out of an “urgent wish to avoid the controversy which might result from the expression.” School officials may not censor peaceful expression solely because other students may have a hostile reaction. Rather, the First Amendment’s guarantee of freedom of speech protects the rights of LGBTQ students to speak and express themselves openly in ways consistent with their identities. School actions that target certain

---


3 See e.g., Davis Next Friend LaShonda D. v. Monroe Cty. Bd. of Educ., 526 U.S. 629, 633 (1999) (recognizing claims of indirect discrimination under Title IX, where school had actual notice of harassment between students but failed to address it); Whitaker By Whitaker, 858 F.3d 1034 (applying Title IX to discrimination based on transgender status). Grimm v. Gloucester Cnty. Sch. Bd., 972 F.3d 586, 617-18 (4th Cir. 2020) (describing injuries to a transgender boy’s physical and emotional health as a result of denial of equal treatment), as amended (Aug. 28, 2020), reh’g en banc denied, 976 F.3d 399 (4th Cir. 2020), cert. denied, 2021 WL 2637992 (June 28, 2021); Adams, 968 F.3d at 1306–07 (describing “emotional damage, stigmatization and shame” experienced by a transgender boy as a result of being subjected to differential treatment); Whitaker ex rel. Whitaker v. Kenosha Unified Sch. Dist. No. 1 Bd. of Educ., 858 F.3d 1034, 1044–46, 1049–50 (7th Cir. 2017) (describing physical and emotional harm to a transgender boy who was denied equal treatment); Dodd v. U.S. Dep’t of Educ., 845 F.3d 217, 221–22 (6th Cir. 2016) (describing “substantial and immediate adverse effects on the daily life and well-being of an eleven year old” transgender girl from denial of equal treatment); Doe v. Univ. of Scranton, 2020 WL 5993766 (M.D.Pa. Oct. 9, 2020), at **1–3 (describing harassment and physical targeting of a gay college student that interfered with the student’s educational opportunity); Harrington ex rel. Harrington v. City of Attleboro, No. 15–CV–12769–DJC, 2018 WL 475000, at **6–7 (D. Mass. Jan. 17, 2018) (describing “wide-spread peer harassment” and physical assault [of a lesbian high school student] because of stereotyping animus focused on [the student’s] sex, appearance, and perceived or actual sexual orientation”).


speech or have the effect of stifling or discouraging identity-affirming speech or expression violate the First Amendment rights of students. Many rights and protections also apply to school teachers and staff.

The proposed legislation would have a paralyzing effect in schools, where teachers could be sued personally for answering a student’s question or responding to a student’s cries for help.

The bill sets a new, vague standard for parental notification based on “changes in student services or monitoring related to emotional or physical health or well-being,” with exceptions only for documentary evidence that such disclosure would result in “child abuse or abandonment.” Parents retain significant rights to consent to medical treatment for minor children, and schools require permission for screenings and treatment. Under the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA), parents are entitled to review student records, including health records of minor children.

It is a common lament that parents want their children to talk to them. Rather than promote student/parent interactions, the bill will deprive students of the counsel of trusted adults, including nurses, counselors and teachers – whom the students have chosen to confide in and who often give students the confidence to have hard conversations with their parents. This legislation seeks to force students to talk to their parents by threatening their teachers.

**SB 1277**

Senator Aument’s bill, SB 1277, begins with the false premise that libraries are filled with sexually explicit materials and that parents have no rights with respect to children’s access to these books. School districts already have policies that govern content and purchase of books and instructional material and rely on trained librarians to select age-appropriate materials. Students’ library circulation records are considered educational records under FERPA that are open to inspection by parents. A small group of parents seeks to inflame public sentiment by extracting and attacking small sections of what they view as explicit content from widely read young adult literature. The bill uses the criminal code to define the offending sexual content, Title 18 Chapter 59, Section 5903 (e)(3), but fails to reference the fact that school libraries, public libraries, historical societies, and museums are specifically exempted from this provision.

The bill creates an onerous process and insufficient timeline for implementation, requiring the review of thousands of books in library collections before September 2022. School boards and libraries will simply remove any books that could be viewed as inappropriate to a small number of parents, especially LGBTQ-themed books, promoting illegal discrimination.

Students have a right to receive information and ideas under the First Amendment as education “prepares students for active and effective participation in the pluralistic, often contentious society in

---

7 See e.g., *Gillman v. School Board for Holmes County*, Florida, 567 F. Supp. 2d 1359 (N.D. Fla. 2008) (a school district’s censorship of T-shirts advocating fair treatment for LGBTQ people was unconstitutional).


9 18 Pa Code 5903(j).
which they will soon be adult members.”

The Constitution does not permit the official suppression of ideas based upon “narrowly partisan or political” interests.

On June 22, the 50th anniversary of Title IX, the US Department of Education reaffirmed that discrimination based on gender identity and sexual orientation is sex discrimination. These proposed laws, which would single out and target LGBTQ youth, would clearly violate the federal law.

In conclusion, these bills show a complete lack of compassion and understanding for thousands of students who identify as gay, bisexual, transgender, or gender diverse and will further marginalize already vulnerable students. Inclusive policies are good for ALL kids. Teaching that everyone deserves respect makes all kids safer, no matter how they identify.

We, the undersigned, urge you to oppose SB 1277 and SB 1278, as they are hostile, harmful, and discriminatory bills.

215 People’s Alliance, Dr. Shivaani Selvaraj, Philadelphia County
Abington For Peace, Amy Martin, Montgomery County
ACLAMO, Nelly Jimenez-Arevalo, Executive Director and CEO, Montgomery County
AIDS Law Project of Pennsylvania, Ronda Goldfein, Philadelphia County
Allies for Children, Jamie Baxter, Executive Director, Allegheny County
American Civil Liberties Union, Pennsylvania Chapter, Sara Mullen, Associate Director, Statewide
Anti-Defamation League (ADL), Andrew Goresky, Regional Director and Robin Burstein, Deputy Regional Director, Eastern Pennsylvania
Bethlehem Area School District, Karen Beck Pooley, School Director, Lehigh & Northampton County
CASA of Philadelphia County, Happi Grillon, Executive Director, Philadelphia County
CASA Youth Advocates, Inc. Leigh Anne McKelvey, LSW MSW, Executive Director, Delaware County and Chester County
Centre County Youth Service Bureau, Christine Bishop, CEO, Centre County
Children First, Donna Cooper, Southeast Pennsylvania
Community Legal Services Inc., Debby Freedman, Executive Director, Philadelphia County

11 Pico, 457 U.S. at 870-72.
Defender Association of Philadelphia, Marni Gangel, Director of Policy for the Child Advocacy Unit of the Defender Association of Philadelphia, Philadelphia County

American Philosophical Society Museum, Merrill Mason, Director Emerita, Philadelphia County

Delta Family Services, Kerry Krieger, LSW, Executive Director, Montgomery County

Disability Rights Pennsylvania, Peri Jude Radecic, Chief Executive Officer, Statewide

Education Law Center-PA, Deborah Gordon Klehr, Executive Director, Statewide

Education Voters of PA, Susan Spicka, Statewide

Educational Studies Department of Swarthmore College, Edwin Mayorga, Delaware County

Empowering Lives Foundation, John S. Seely, Head Coach and Executive Director, Blair County

First Law Strategy Group, Hillary Weinstein, Philadelphia County

Health Education & Legal Assistance Project at Widener University, Susanna Greenberg, Managing Attorney, Philadelphia County and Delaware County

Institute on Disabilities, Sally Gould-Taylor, PhD, Executive Director, Philadelphia County

Juvenile Law Center, Susan Mangold, CEO, Philadelphia County

La Puerta Abierta, Inc., Cathi Tillman, Executive Director, Montgomery County

League of Women Voters of Pennsylvania, Sarah Miller, Statewide

Mazzoni Center, Thomas W. Ude, Jr., Statewide

NAACP Pennsylvania State Conference, Diana Robertson, Second Vice President, Statewide

Pennsylvania Association of Rural and Small Schools (PARSS), Edward Albert, Statewide

Pennsylvania Association of School Nurses and Practitioners, Jeanette Slimmer, CSN, President, Statewide

Pennsylvania Budget and Policy Center, Marc Stier, Director, PA Budget and Policy Center, Dauphin County

Pennsylvania Education Scholars, Susan DeJarnatt, Philadelphia County

Pennsylvania Educator Diversity Consortium (PEDC), Donna-Marie Cole-Malott, Chester County

Pennsylvania Family Support Alliance, Angela M. Liddle, President and CEO, Cumberland County and Dauphin County

Pennsylvania Institutional Law Project, Su Ming Yeh, Statewide

Pennsylvania Parent and Family Alliance, Statewide

Pennsylvania School Counselors Association, Emilia Peiffer, Executive Director, Statewide
Pennsylvania School Librarians Association, Laura Ward, President, Statewide
Pennsylvania State Education Association, Rich Askey, President, Statewide
Pennsylvania Youth Congress, Jason Landau Goodman, Statewide
Pennsylvanians for Fair Funding, Laura Johnson, Montgomery County
Philadelphia Diversity Law Group, Leslie E. John, Philadelphia County
Philadelphia Federation of Teachers, Jerry Jordan, President, Philadelphia County
Philadelphia Participatory Research Collective, Kristen Goessling, PhD, Delaware County
Philly Children’s Movement, Jen Bradley, Core Member, Philadelphia County
Red Wine and Blue, Ronna Dewey, Pennsylvania Program Director, Statewide
Research for Action, Kate Callahan, Executive Director, Philadelphia County
Serenity Solutions, LLC, Alisa Kamis-Brinda, Philadelphia County
Sociale, Elizabeth McNevin, Chester County
Support Center for Child Advocates, Frank P. Cervone, Executive Director, Philadelphia County
Teach Plus Pennsylvania, Laura Boyce, Executive Director, Statewide
The Field Center for Children’s Policy, Practice & Research, Philadelphia County
The Homeless Advocacy Project, Dean M. Beer, Philadelphia County
The Public Interest Law Center, Brenda L. Marrero, Executive Director, Philadelphia County
Vision for Equality, Inc., Maureen Devaney, Co-Executive Director, Statewide
Youth Art & Self-Empowerment Project, Sarah Morris, Co-Director, Philadelphia County

Individual signers and county
Erika Kitzmiller Philadelphia/Franklin
David I. Backer Philadelphia
Susan L. DeJarnatt Philadelphia
Timothy R Dougherty Chester
Dina Portnoy Philadelphia
Elaine Simon Philadelphia
Thierry Elin-Saintine, Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Math PA
Kristen Murray, Professor of Law Philadelphia
Barbara Ferman, Professor of Political Science Philadelphia
Rachel Skrlac Lo, Assistant Professor Delaware
Meghan Reikob Chester
Len Rieser Philadelphia
Jennifer Bradley, Ph.D. Philadelphia
Laura rice Chester
Barry McCarthy Philadelphia
Larry Udell Chester
Madora Soutter, EdD Montgomery & Delaware
Lauren Vargas, Education Consultant Philadelphia
Theresa Glennon, Professor Emerita Montgomery
Sarah Apt Philadelphia
Liam McCarthy Montgomery
Kathy Volin PA
Dr. Cherie Crosby-Weeks Montgomery
Dr. Christa Bialka Delaware
Dr. Kim Pinckney-Lewis Cumberland
Dr. Jason Bialka Chester
Professor Jules Epstein Montgomery
Jodi Nawrocki Chester
Leigh Patel, Professor of Urban Education Allegheny
Terence Yee Montgomery
Dana Morrison, PhD, Assistant Professor Philadelphia
Andrew W. Norfleet Cumberland
Benjamin Brumley Chester
Rachel Daltry, PsyD Delaware
E. Douglas DiSandro, Jr. Philadelphia
Scott Burris, Professor of Law and Public Health, Temple University Montgomery
Sarah Katz, Clinical Professor of Law, Temple University Philadelphia
Professor Kara Finck Philadelphia
Vesper Yang, LCSW Philadelphia
Diane D. Anderson Delaware
Rosemary A Barbera, Ph.D, MSS Phila
Lauren Fine, Esq. Philadelphia
Lucy Johnston-Walsh Cumberland
Dr. Andrea Terrero Gabbadon Philadelphia
Wonho Lee PA
Jessica Cordaro Luzerne
Elaine Allard, Associate Professor Philadelphia
Kathryn Potalivo Philadelphia
Gretchen Santamour Philadelphia
Daniel Laurison  Philadelphia
Patrick McNeil  Philadelphia
Joyce Pickles  Montgomery
Taylor Fairchild  Franklin
Melissa Brookes, Executive Director Clinical Operations  Montgomery
Emily Baron  Allegheny
Molly Levine  Allegheny
Brian Ortelere  Philadelphia
Nadia Billig Daniel  Philadelphia
Thomas D. Sutton  Montgomery
Jennifer Layden  Allegheny
Aaron Skrypski  Philadelphia
Susan McCreadie  Chester
Kimberly Clash  Cumberland
Jessica Stow  Philadelphia
Abbey Sarault  Montgomery
Matthew Rader  Philadelphia
Jennifer Leonard  Philadelphia
Robin Ortelere  Philadelphia
Dorothy Troutman  Lancaster
Shanda Sibley, Clinical Assistant Professor of Law  Philadelphia
Samantha Gioffre  Philadelphia
Heather R.  Montgomery
Courtney Marello  Philadelphia
Lisa Smulyan  Delaware
Diane Zilka  Philadelphia
Molly Castellano  Philadelphia
Nathan Young  Philadelphia
Jasmine Joyner  Chester
Polina Ross  Philadelphia
Barbara Cohen  Philadelphia
Heidi Siegel  PA
Viola Vetter, Esq.  Philadelphia
John Daniels  York
Hope Shafer  Bucks
Shaun Bockert  Philadelphia
Kiersten Klebanoff  Montgomery
Monica Lavin  Montgomery
Amy Wetmore  Allegheny
Phyllis Gottlieb  Philadelphia
Sandie Paduano  Philadelphia
Sarah Singer Quast  Philadelphia
Susan Xiong  Philadelphia
Debra O’Connor  Philadelphia
Nicole M. Dress  Montgomery
Paula Sayre  Bucks
Alyson Bauer  Philadelphia
Bronwyn Sayre  Bucks & Philadelphia
Audrey Sayre  Bucks
Amanda Milo  Philadelphia
Sarah Elder  Montgomery
Isabelle Barker  PA
Susan Berman Kress  Allegheny
Sophie Sepel  Philadelphia
Dara R.  Chester
Cara Palladino  Philadelphia
Amanda Brown Cross, PhD  Allegheny
Katherine Driscoll  Delaware
Laurie Gottlieb  Philadelphia
Dr. Courtney Kuza  Allegheny
Lorie Spohn  Lehigh
Joel Kichline  Lehigh
Michael Potalivo  Philadelphia
Amy Badey  Montgomery
Elizabeth Kerr  Montgomery
John Deininger  Philadelphia
E. Sherman Hayman  Philadelphia
Sarah Anne Eckert, Assistant Professor of Education  Montgomery
Deborah Wei  Philadelphia
Layla Helwa  Philadelphia
Conor Richardson  Delaware
Lori Delale-O'Connor, Assistant Professor  Allegheny
Michelle Grace  Philadelphia
Natalie Georges  Delaware
Grace Brevart  Delaware
Katherine Collier  Philadelphia
Francesca Lopez, PhD  Centre
Annabelle Lyons  Philadelphia
Leana Solomon  Montgomery
Karynne Henry Lancaster
Logan Martin Lancaster
Avery Stauffer Lancaster
Carla Dolio, School Counselor Delaware
Kate H. PA
Danielle Duva Philadelphia
Morgan Machiorlette Philadelphia
Lisa Silverman Allegheny
Lynne Sitvarin Bucks
Ashlyn Barton Franklin
Alayna Henry Lancaster
Karen Sharrar, M.D. Philadelphia
Sheila Frederick Montgomery
Jerusha Conner, Professor of Education Delaware
Mackenzie Ashton Montgomery
Kate McInerney-Rowley Chester
Mallory Bernstein Allegheny
Evelyn Ameisen Chester
Erica Loose Berks
Amanda Hedrick Philadelphia
Bailey Reale, MPH Westmoreland
Laurie Benko Delaware
Katelyn Ducat Philadelphia
Dr. Anne Blackwell Chester
Abby Sneddon Franklin
Heather Trotman Chester
Sarah Logue Montgomery
Megan Monahan, public school teacher Montgomery
Kaitlin Gottuso Delaware
Arden Ippolito Bucks
Olivia C. McGee, MAT Lancaster
Tricia Royer, DO, FIDSA Montgomery
Jennifer Rowe Chester
Elizabeth Herron Northampton
Amy Farr Armstrong
Kelly Wolfenden Lehigh
Olivia Kirsch Allegheny
P Michael Jones, Esq. Delaware
Jennifer Liney Philadelphia
Elizabeth Rappaport Philadelphia
J. Casciano Lehigh
Meagan Mirtenbaum          Philadelphia
Amanda McParland           Philadelphia
Corey Luthringer           Erie
Alexandra Siedsma          Allegheny
Evan W.                    Philadelphia
Michelle Lubetsky          Allegheny
Tanya Geier                Chester
Andrew Sheaffer            PA
Erin Guy                   Allegheny
Melissa Plotnick           Allegheny
Briana Clouser             New Holland
Danielle Melan, Parent and Educator Lackawanna
Jemma Lindquist            Lancaster
Hadar Spector              Philadelphia
Martha Marich              Philadelphia
Miles Marich Tartar        Philadelphia
Karen Alkire               Montgomery
Laura Navish               Allegheny
Alexandra Gatter           Bucks
David B. Wasserman         Montgomery
Danielle Schmitt           Allegheny
Laura Bowir                Philadelphia
Zebulon Plotnick           Allegheny
Lauren Hergert             Allegheny
Emily Caplin               Bucks & Warrington
Barbara Monegan            Delaware
Lewis Reagan               York
Christine Lay              Cumberland
Tiffany Kim                Philadelphia
Rob McClimon               Chester
Miranda Lauritzen          Cumberland
Eileen Jacobs              Philadelphia
Angela Bleemer             Montgomery
Patricia Cobleigh          Montgomery
Karen McLane               Montgomery
Samantha Silberstein       Philadelphia
Michele Rubincam           Montgomery
Lisa Diez                  Montgomery
Sheila Hannigan Williams   Philadelphia
Damon Constantinides, Social Worker Philadelphia
Karen Mauch                Philadelphia
Lucy Grimes
Rebecca Rutstein
Jane Scipione Weiss
Leslie Biskup
Colleen Clear
William Cassidy
Colleen McGarry
Kacee Rava
Jennifer Phuong, Visiting Assistant Professor at Swarthmore College
Dr. Maria Guerin
Katheryn Jones
Brenna Cosgrove
Natalie Romano-Nuesch
Hannah Augustyniak
Sara Jaffee, PhD, Professor of Psychology at University of Pennsylvania
Melani Lamond
Adina Diehl
Stephanie Spicer
Rachel Porterfield
Katherine O’Neill
Jesse Kozlowksi
David James Baker
B. Wexler
Kristen O’Hara, Teacher

Allegheny
Montgomery
Philadelphia
Montgomery
Philadelphia
Lancaster
Luzerne
Luzerne
Philadelphia & Delaware
Philadelphia
Delaware
Butler
Montgomery
Philadelphia
Philadelphia
Philadelphia
Lancaster
Montgomery
Allegheny
Philadelphia
Allegheny
Lackawanna
Delaware
Philadelphia